

Hype or Hope: Mindfulness Training for Physicians

A Systematic Review of the Impact of Mindfulness-Based Interventions on Physicians' Well-being and Performance in Medical Practice

Prof. Kiki Lombarts, MSc PhD Amsterdam UMC, Amsterdam, The Netherlands Amsterdam Center for **Professional Performance** and **Compassionate Care**





Research team

- Renee Scheepers, PhD:
 - Socio-Medical Sciences, Erasmus School of Health Policy and Management, Erasmus University of Rotterdam, The Netherlands
- Helga Emke, PhD candidate:
 - Department of Health Sciences, Faculty of Science, Free University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands
- Prof. Ronald Epstein, MD PhD:
 - Department of Family Medicine, Psychiatry & Oncology, University of Rochester Medical Center, Rochester, MI, United States
- Prof. Kiki Lombarts, PhD
 - Research group Professional Performance & Compassionate Care, Dep. Of Mediscal Psychologie, Amsterdam University Medical Center, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Professional Performance & Compassionate Care

Amsterdam Center for **Professional Performance** and **Compassionate Care**

- Research focus on measuring, clarifying and improving physicians' professional performance
 - 3 Pillars of Professional Performance:
 - 1. Constant pursuit of excellence
 - 2. Humanistic Practice
 - 3. Accountability
- Physician well-being
 - inherent part of professionalism
 - conditional for high quality patient care



Interventions to improve well-being

. Mindfulness-based interventions (MBI)

- "Purposeful and non-judgmental attention to present experiences, thoughts and feelings"
- Mindfulness meditation exercises
 - Breathing
 - Mind-body scanning

JAMA Internal Medicine | Original Investigation | PHYSICIAN WORK ENVIRONMENT AND WELL-BEING Controlled Interventions to Reduce Burnout in Physicians A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis

Maria Panagioti, PhD; Efharis Panagopoulou, PhD; Peter Bower, PhD; George Lewith, MD; Evangelos Kontopantelis, PhD; Carolyn Chew-Graham, MD; Shoba Dawson, PhD; Harm van Marwijk, MD; Keith Geraghty, PhD; Aneez Esmail, MD



Effects of MBI

Focus on present-moment

Concentration & psychological distress

- \rightarrow Well-being
 - Stress
 - Burnout
- → Performance
 - Empathy: interpersonal domains
 - Attention & awareness: safety domains



This systematic review

- •Effects of MBI on
 - Well-being
 - Performance



Method

- PubMed & PsychInfo
 - Mindfulness
 - Physicians
- Abstract & full-text screening
 - Two researchers
- Quality assesment
 - Medical Education Research Study Quality Instrument*

*Reed et al. Predictive validity evidence for medical education research study quality instrument scores: quality of submissions to JGIM's Medical Education Special Issue. *J Gen Intern Med*. 2008;23(7): 903-7.



934 unique hits \rightarrow 23 eligible articles

- Randomized controlled trials
- Controlled trials
- Pre-post studies
- Interview study
- Study quality
 - Average MERSQI score = 9.6

- 6 studies
- 3 studies
- 12 studies
- 2 studies



Mindfulness-based interventions

- Group-based: 20 studies
- Individual-based: 3 studies
- Outcome measures
 - Well-being
 - Physical
 - Psychological
 - Occupational
 - Performance
 - Interpersonal
 - Safety



Physical well-being

- Heart rate & blood
 pressure
- Self-reported physical health

+ Psychological well-being

- Anxiety
- Distress
- Mood
- Mental health
- Quality of life
- + Occupational well-being
 - Burnout
 - Dedication
 - Empowerment at work
 - Specialty satisfaction



+ Interpersonal performance

- Empathy
- Patient-centered communication

± Safety performance

- Cognitive failures
- Medical errors
- Hand hygiene adherence



Discussion

- Popularity of MBI
 - 19 out of 23 eligible studies: 2014-2018
- MBI: hype or hope?
 - Evidence-based hope
 - Psychological well-being
 - Occupational well-being
 - Negative & positive indicators
- Tailoring of MBI to different well-being needs
 - Prevention of burnout
 - Well-being promotion



Discussion

- Mindfulness & performance
 - Empathic communication
 - Patient safety
- Physicians
 - Listening
 - Attentive to concerns
 - Effective responses
- Patients
 - Patient-centred
 - Rapport building
 - Discussion of psychosocial issues



Discussion

Limitations

- Long-term outcomes
- Patient-reported outcomes
- More RCT's
- Placebo-interventions?
- Directions for future research
 - Knowledge gaps
 - Standardization of MBI



Prof. dr. Kiki Lombarts, Amsterdam UMC, University of Amsterdam

m.j.lombarts@amsterdamumc.nl